

**CBC**  
**October 24 – 25, 2002**  
**Los Banos, Philippines**

**SUMMARY OF PROCEEDINGS**

**Agenda Item 1**

The Chairman welcomed members of the CBC to the meeting. Regrets had been received from Lauritz Holm-Nielsen (CIAT), Dave McKenzie (CIP), Lucy Edwards (ICRAF) and Geoff Miller (IFPRI). Bob Kearney would be arriving late, and N. Maeno, CIAT Board Member would be representing CIAT. A full list of participants is attached as Annex 1.

The Chairman welcomed Remo Gautschi, incoming-Chair of IWMI who was attending the CBC meeting as an observer.

The Chairman informed the meeting that Dave Mackenzie was in critical condition, and the Board sent best wishes for a very speedy recovery.

The Chairman reminded members that a meeting with the CBC and the Chairman and Director of the CGIAR was scheduled for Sunday, October 27 from 6.45. He intended to appoint spokespersons on specific issues to be raised with the Chairman at that meeting.

On behalf of IRRI, Angeline Kamba welcomed the CBC to IRRI headquarters in Los Banos, and wished everyone a successful meeting and a pleasant stay.

Lindsay Innes, Chairman of WARDA, briefed the CBC on the current state of WARDA. He expressed his appreciation for all the expressions of support and concern for the staff, and paid tribute to the DG and staff for their commitment to the institution during these difficult times. Particular mention was made of the support received from the CG Secretariat, the World Bank and the Government of France. IITA was also thanked for their willingness to welcome staff. It was agreed that Lindsay Innes would continue to keep the CBC apprised of the situation.

The Chairman briefed the meeting on the local security situation, and reminded members that although it was relatively quiet in the Manila area, it was necessary to be very careful when traveling throughout the country. He agreed to keep CBC members informed of any changes to the situation.

CBC members expressed their condolences to the Chairman and to the Government and people of Australia for the loss of life experienced in the Bali bombing.

## **Agenda Item 2: Review and Approval of Draft Agenda**

After few points of clarification, the Draft Agenda was approved with noted additions and is attached as Annex 2.

All Summary Notes and Background Papers for all Agenda Items are posted on the CBC website.

## **Agenda Item 3**

### **Review and approval of meeting in Washington, Oct. 2001.**

Agreed:

- The Minutes as tabled reflect the spirit of discussions held during the meeting, although much has been overtaken by events. The Minutes of the October 2001 meeting of the CBC were approved.

### **Review and approval of Draft Notes of CBC Retreat in Rome.**

- With a vote of thanks to the Chair and the CBC Secretariat for producing an excellent set of proceedings, the Summary of Proceedings of the CBC Retreat held in Rome, September 2002, were approved with minor corrections.

## **Agenda Item 4: Follow-Up From September Retreat**

The follow-up actions from CBC's Rome Retreat were reviewed and the Action Item table updated. The table is attached as Annex 3.

### **ExCo III: Update**

Moise Mensah briefed the CBC on the outcome of ExCo III which he had attended on behalf of the Chair.

- System Office. A SO outline was discussed and a draft will be examined at AGM. A business plan for 2003 has been prepared but not yet endorsed. It suggests a budget of \$10 million for 2002-2003 with WB funding 50% and Centers 19%, the rest coming from other sources.
- CGIAR Financing. A presentation was made that shows total funding proposal for 2003 amounting to \$379 million including \$232 restricted funds. Centers' financing plans for year 2003 were found reasonable. The Chair of the Financing Committee expressed the Committee's concerns with Centers which submit plans with deficit (CIP, IITA, IRRI). He said that FC was unhappy with resource allocation pattern by the CGIAR system which led Centers to look for projects that can provide money even though they may not respond to CGIAR priorities. He also questioned WB matching system as a resource allocation approach because it does not take Center performance into account. He recommended that the CGIAR should include performance-based allocation in its resource allocation patterns. FC Chair cautioned against too much expectations from so-called new

wealth and suggested greater reliance on traditional donors. It was proposed to hold a workshop in March 2003 on long-term financing strategy.

- Challenge Programs. Issues discussed included the risks related to inadequate funding, governance and management, the need for oversight by ExCo, performance evaluation. These issues will be revisited. It was noted that the question as to how much money must be pre-pledged before AGM approved challenge programs should be addressed. A suggestion was made that a candidate-CP should mobilize at least 25% of its targeted funding level. The CPs on Water and Food, Biofortification were endorsed for submission to AGM. The CP on Genetic Diversity was not found ready for approval.
- Science Council. Issues discussed related essentially to possible overlap with other bodies (PC, GFAR, etc.). CBC expressed the wish to be associated in the process of the search for the SC Chair. This request was found to be appropriate. There is an expectation that proposals for the nomination of members of the search committee should be made within the next 2/3 weeks.
- System-Wide Programs/Initiatives. There was no objection to the CDC proposals described in the paper submitted to ExCo, and made available to CBC.
- GRPC Review. Remarks were made on the 15 member apparatus proposed by the review panel, especially the need for this size; possibilities for a cheaper option; linkages with IPGRI and SC. CDC raised a question about the recommendation made for Centers to finance the initiative. It thought funds from the Secretariat might be more appropriate to provide a system-wide service.
- EPMRs. ExCo was informed of the CBC concern on the code of conduct for Reviews. The ExCo Chair requested the CBC Chair to write to him on the matter and he said that if there are lessons to be learned on a code of conduct, the CGIAR should learn such lessons. On the CIP review, I understand that ExCo did not support the request for extra funds. Regarding ISNAR, a change team will be established comprising representatives from stakeholders to work with ISNAR's Board of Trustees in bringing about necessary changes.

#### Discussion:

- System Office: CBC stressed the importance of ensuring the System Office does what is required by the Centers. All decisions must be made in full agreement with the Centers.
- CGIAR Financing:
  - Profound concerns were raised regarding that decisions made by the Finance Committee during ExCo III appeared inconsistent with the recommendations of the Science Council and the Program Committee.

- Members voiced their unease regarding the terms of reference of ExCo which they felt had been set up as a body to review and make recommendations to the full CGIAR. Recent events at ExCo III appeared to indicate that ExCo was now acting as a decision-making body.
- A review should be made of the Minutes of ExCo III as distributed by the CG Secretariat vs. the Summary of the Meeting as distributed by the CG Director. The Summary did not reflect the full range of discussions at the meeting, and the full implications of the decisions taken at the meeting were not fully outlined in the Summary.
- CBC felt the Finance Committee's blunt condemnation of deficit financing was disturbing, and was concerned to learn that in future the WB funds would be reviewed against performance indicators. Would the Science Council, Finance Committee or ExCo set the performance indicators and analyze Center performance? These issues must be raised with the Chairman/Director.

Action:

- Agenda Item for discussion with Chairman/Director.
- CBC to be represented at the March 2003 workshop on long-term financing strategy.
- Bob Havener to prepare background note for May 2003 workshop.
- Challenge Programs:
  - CBC expressed concern that the Program Committee was in a position to override Science Council recommendations and questioned the processes and procedures used to recommend only two Challenge Programs instead of three. Clarification on this point from the Chairman/Director was requested.
  - The issue of inter-Center collaboration was discussed in detail, including the possibility of setting up governance mechanisms that would foster enhanced cooperation and optimize synergies. A Code of Conduct should be prepared to determine how the Centers could best work together.

Action:

- Code to Conduct for Inter-Center Collaboration to be discussed at joint CBC/CDC meeting.

Decisions taken after CBC/CDC meeting (Oct. 25)

- Joint CBC/CDC Working Group to be created to prepare Codes of Conduct for Inter-Center Collaboration. CBC representatives: Mort Neufville, Martha Stone).
- EPMRs: Clarification was requested on the appropriateness of the Finance Committee recommending that ISNAR not receive additional donor funding. It appeared that the Finance Committee's recommendations were not consistent with the views of the Science Council and the Program Committee. They noted a disturbing pattern of centralized decision-making. CBC questioned the authority

of the Finance Committee. Were the CG guiding principles based on science or money? Further discussion on this issue will be discussed under Agenda Item 5.

### **Monitoring Center Performance**

Discussion:

- CBC agreed purpose of exercise should be to produce a set of performance indicators for Board use.
- CBC agreed the scope of the exercise should focus on the relevance and consistency of Center science and the relationship to individual Center missions, as well as strategies and the programs to fulfill those strategies. The division of labor between Board and Center management was reiterated and CBC acknowledged this can be a complex situation.
- “White Board” exercise focused on who, when and how often, what and why CBC should want to monitor Center performance.
- The exercise should focus specific attention on EPMRs and CCERs to ensure these existing processes are of use of the Centers.
- CBC stressed the importance of designing a system which includes the quantification of impact in addition to ongoing monitoring and evaluation.
- The exercise should produce a set of performance indicators which could be used outside the boundaries of individual Centers to highlight opportunities for working together as a system.

Action:

- CBC to create an ad hoc committee to consider this matter in greater detail and develop criteria/common indicators to monitor the performance of the Centers. Working Group to report back to full CBC for further discussion and action. Members: John Vercoe, Lindsay Innes and Mort Neufville.
- Chair to discuss matter with Chair of CDC to determine if committee should be instituted jointly with the CDC.

### **CBC/CDC Agenda Items:**

The draft agenda for the joint CBC/CDC meeting was reviewed. It was agreed that individual CBC members would take the lead in introducing the following Agenda Items at the joint meeting. The draft Agenda is attached as Annex 4.

### **Grievance Procedures**

Discussion:

- The issue of Senior Staff Appeals and Grievance Procedures was on the draft agenda for discussion at the joint CBC/CDC meeting. As a result of that meeting, it was hoped that the CBC/CDC would produce a joint position paper on this subject.
- Caryl was requested to follow up with Center Board Secretaries to receive individual Center policies, as well as to obtain the notes of the SASHR Committee which had been held in Colombo in early September. These documents were to be posted on the CBC web site for member information.

- It was agreed that it was not possible to establish a Center-wide Senior Staff Appeals Process. However, Centers can produce a set of overarching principles which all should adhere to. CBC would need to reach agreement with CDC on this point prior to informing the Secretariat and membership.

Action:

- Board Secretaries to provide individual Center policies (Caryl)
- Notes of SAS-HR to be circulated to CBC (Caryl)
- Agenda Item for joint CBC/CDC meeting.

Decision taken after joint CBC/CDC meeting (Oct. 25):

- Joint CBC/CDC working group to be established to produce Code of Personal Conduct for Board Members and Senior Staff . CBC representatives: John Vercoe, Martha Stone, Mort Neufville and Bob Kearney.

**Public Awareness/Future Harvest**

Alex McCalla briefed the CBC on the outcome of the PARC meeting which had been held in Los Banos on October 23. He reported that:

- PARC functions as a system-wide oversight and coordinating mechanism on a number of activities on public awareness. It appears to be a self-mandated group with no formal Terms of Reference or reporting mechanism. PARC receives a substantial budget from Centers.
- Membership on PARC is not formal. Currently membership comprises: Four DGs (1 as Chair), a representative of Future Harvest Foundation, a representative of the Secretariat, the Director of the CG, the Chairman of Finance Committee, the Chairman of Board of the Future Harvest Foundation and several informal members. Currently CBC does not have permanent membership on PARC.
- The Director of FH had presented a draft strategic plan for Future Harvest which was very ambitious and requested same level of funding from Centers for next four years, after which this time FH envisioned being self-sustaining. The Director of FH requested an external review of FH to include monitoring the PA activities in the Centers as well as the work currently undertaken by the Secretariat. This request had not been endorsed by PARC.
- There was still no system-wide integrated communications strategy, and it did not appear likely that this would be prepared until 2003.
- A CDC task force was proposed to look into the Centers need for a more effective information and communications function and, to examine the transition of wider ownership of resource mobilization and public awareness within the CG System.

Discussion:

- CBC emphasized the importance of the integrated public awareness and resource mobilization function within the CG system and considered it one of the important pillars of CG reform.
- Agreed on the importance of an external review clarifying activities within the Future Harvest, the Centers and Secretariat, and commended the FH Director for requesting this review.

- Agreed to the proposed Task Force to review PARC and requested CBC have an opportunity to review the TORS for this working group. CBC to nominate two members to serve on the Task Force.

Action:

- CBC to inform CDC of their request to proceed with external review of Future Harvest, as well as participation in proposed Task Force to review PARC.
- Item for discussion on joint CBC/CDC agenda.

Decision taken after joint CBC/CDC meeting (Oct. 25):

- CBC to participate on Task Force to Revitalize PARC. CBC Representative: Alex McCalla.

### **GM Technologies**

Angeline Kamba briefed the CBC on the Southern African drought, particularly the issue of distributing GM food aid.

Discussion:

- CBC feels the CG has an important role to play in advocacy and raising public awareness on the issues surrounding GM foods, and recommends a concerted effort be made in Southern Africa undertake training programs to promote CG views.
- Concern was expressed regarding the ExCo decision not to recommend Challenge Program on Genetic Diversity, and requested more information as to why this CP was not approved at this time. Was the GM component the issue?

Action:

- CBC Chair to follow-up with Secretariat.

### **African Program Coordination**

Mort Neufville tabled a Summary Note to introduce the Agenda Item.

Discussion:

- CBC urged Centers to coordinate their efforts in Africa, and urged Centers to be receptive to the needs of the client. Centers were advised to cooperate and work with those regional networks and partner organizations who are already working in Africa. Centers should identify partners and plan coordinated strategies very carefully utilizing existing infrastructure.
- Reference was made to the CDC program on Africa and the consultations undertaken in conjunction with that work. It was agreed that CBC needs to represent a corporate view to ensure the Centers build on what has been done in the past to avoid a duplication of effort. The appointment of a Coordinator to pull the coordinated program together was discussed.
- It was agreed that the CGIAR must move quickly to maintain the momentum achieved after WSSD and the NEPAD. The CBC/CDC must work with a sense of urgency and present donors with a coordinated program.

Action:

- CBC Chair to discuss issue further with Chair of CDC and place Item on Agenda for joint CBC/CDC meeting.

## **Agenda Item 5: Implementing EPMR Recommendations**

Benchaphun Shinawatra Ekasingh tabled a Summary Note to introduce the Agenda Item.

Discussion:

- CBC reiterated the primary purpose of EPMRs is to improve Center performance. The Board of each Center must be actively engaged in the EPMRs, especially in approving the composition of the of the Review Panel. EPMRs are a total review package and need to include all aspects of program review – both research and program management. EPMRs need not, however, focus on administrative management.
- Board and Senior Managers must be more involved in Panel discussions and consultations to ensure greater integration and understanding on the part of the EPMR.
- In some cases not all recommendations are appropriate and, for a variety of reasons, not all can be implemented. It must be understood that EPMR recommendations may not be accepted by Board and Center management. The System needs to acknowledge this and adhere to the advice of Centers.
- The Board is responsible for monitoring the results of an EPMR and for ensuring follow-up. The recommendations of the EPMR aim to produce a forward-looking, action-oriented, work plan which can then be incorporated into Center mid-term planning. *There is an inherent conflict between the Board and ExCo both monitoring the results of the EPMR which produces overlap and duplication of effort.*
- Concern was raised regarding the lack of donor involvement in EPMRs. The previous process allowed for substantive conversation between the Board, the DGs, and donors. It appears that the new process isolates donors from discussing issues with Centers.
- A code of conduct should be established for EPMR Panel Members and also for the EPMR process as a whole. Panel Members must be held accountable for following an established set of rules and regulations. The EPMR process must follow a prescribed process prior to submission to the AGM for discussion.

Action:

- CBC agreed to alert the Chairman to their concerns, and determined to position themselves as a group to advise the Chairman to ensure the system is more effective and efficient.
- Code of Conduct: paper to be prepared for circulation to full CBC membership setting out definitive procedures to be followed during reviews. (John Vercoe/Benchaphun Shinawatra Ekasingh)

## **Agenda Item 6: DG Matters**

The Chair reviewed the confidential background information prepared by the Association of International Agricultural Research Centers (AIARC) which had been distributed to all CBC members prior to the meeting.

### Discussion:

- Useful to learn from each other and to share individual experiences. However, individual policies should be left for individual Centers. Agreement was reached on the value of sharing information on process, keeping in mind differences in Center cultures and locations.
- CBC agreed it was very difficult for the CBC to produce or recommend a standard remuneration package for all Centers, and that the purpose of the annual evaluation as prepared by AIARC was to provide a reference for future DG recruitment. It was also agreed that, given the difference in the financial situation of each Center, it was difficult to have parity on annual increments. The differences in DG salaries were shrinking, but there was still a variation in the benefits packages. It was noted that two Centers did not provide data for this evaluation.
- CBC emphasized that Boards have responsibility to recruit the best qualified candidate for the positions of Director General, and the decision on remuneration must be left flexible. It was agreed that the CBC would benefit from more information regarding comparator organizations.
- CBC recognized the importance of staff input regarding DG evaluation, and discussed the benefits of conducting 360 degree feedback exercises, both as a means of evaluating DG performance as well as providing a basis for highlighting future training needs. CBC agreed this exercise should be discussed more fully with respective boards.
- Donor expectations, both stated and unstated, must be kept in mind especially where gender and diversity issues are concerned.
- Remuneration for DDGs and other senior staff was highly variable subject to tenure, disciplines and qualifications.
- CBC agreed to discuss this matter annually at their fall meeting.

### Action:

- Determine which two Centers did not provide data for AIARC evaluation (Caryl)
- Provide list of World Bank comparator organizations to CBC (Caryl)
- Annual Agenda Item.

## **Agenda Item 7: CG Nominees on Center Boards**

John Vercoe informed the meeting that he had not received a response from the Secretariat in reply to his e-mail of October 3, 2002, in which he had recommended that

the CBC work with the Secretariat to develop a more streamlined process for the identification of Board members, including CG nominated Trustees.

Discussion:

- Reiterated the importance of maintaining ultimate responsibility for the final selection of Board members, and insisted they were not willing to generate two classes of Board members. Identical procedures would be followed for all Board members, not just those listed as CG nominees.
- Recognized that all Board members must be thoroughly briefed on the CG system as a whole, and believes this can be a focus of the Board Orientation Programs.
- Stressed that the current database of potential Board nominees does not meet the needs of the Boards and that a new system of candidate identification needs to be implemented.
- Appropriate next steps must be agreed with Secretariat.

Action:

- Chairman to discuss at CDC/CBC joint meeting and with Chairman/Director at AGM, prior to following-up with Secretariat.

## **Agenda Item 8: Board Orientation Programs**

Discussion:

- Agreement was reached on the importance of an effective and cost efficient Board Orientation Program which includes a regional perspective and addresses the problems of language.
- Orientation programs can be managed by CBC and held at Centers. Timing of Orientations to be determined.
- CBC must drive the agenda, and should set up a mechanism of serving Center Boards including information on issues they wish to see addressed in Orientations.
- Some funding may come from CBC budget but the possibility of funds from the Secretariat that are currently being used for this purpose needs to be explored.

Action:

- Survey Center Boards to determine scope of orientations, curriculum and timing (Martha Stone/Angeline Kamba).
- Results to be presented to Secretariat as guide for future requirements.

## **Agenda Item 9: CBC Communications**

John Vercoe presented a discussion paper outlining a draft communications plan. After some discussion, it was agreed to update this plan for further discussion with the Chairman/Director. The revised document is attached as Annex 5.

Action:

- Agenda Item for Chairman/Director at AGM.

## **Agenda Item 10: Gender & Diversity**

Jag Maini tabled a background paper to introduce the Agenda Item.

Discussion:

- CBC is fully committed to the identification and recruitment of the most qualified candidates to fill all DG and Board vacancies.
- Issues of Gender and Diversity are very important and require disciplined action.
- Efforts should be made to seek more potential candidates from under-represented groups. In order to identify potential candidates, CBC recommends the establishment of a new database for senior women scientists.
- Mentoring and management training programs must be provided to promising candidates, and Centers must be encouraged to develop leadership for the future. Sources of funding should be identified for such training programs.
- CBC agreed to seek clarification on the role and functions of the G&D unit, especially with regards to their involvement in staff appeals and mediation. G&D mission creep appeared to be as a result of weaknesses in Center HR functions. CBC encouraged the valuable professional advice provided by the G&D Unit to be incorporated in Center HR policies and procedures.
- CBC reiterated its concern with approving funding for the second G&D Survey and felt the resources could be used more efficiently (creation of database; policy development?). It was agreed to discuss this further at the joint CBC/CDC meeting.

Action:

- Item to be discussed at joint CBC/CDC meeting.

Decisions taken after joint CBC/CDC meeting (Oct. 25):

- CBC does not endorse second G&D study. Chairman G&D Board to be informed of CBC decision (Chairman)
- CBC endorses external review of G&D program and agrees to participate fully in TORS of review.
- Lucy Edwards to continue to represent CBC on G&D Board.

## **Agenda Item 11: CBC Budget**

Alex McCalla tabled a draft budget for discussion.

Discussion:

- A detailed CBC budget should be finalized to fund attendance at ExCo, Science Council, PARC meetings, as well as other meetings when members were asked to participate on behalf of the Board Chair. Budget to include funding for Executive

Secretary, compensation for Board Chair, and the design and operation of Board Orientation Programs.

- Funding should be requested from individual Centers, and be approved by individual Center Directors.

Action:

- Item for discussion at joint CBC/CDC meeting.

Decisions taken after joint CBC/CDC meeting (Oct. 25):

- Detailed budget to be prepared and presented to individual Boards for funding.
- Request Secretariat to contribute funds for Board Orientation Program (Chairman)
- CBC account to be opened (Caryl to follow-up with AIARC).

## **Agenda Item 12: Board Compensation**

Lauritz Holm-Nielsen tabled a background paper for discussion, and Alex McCalla presented a draft proposal.

After discussion, CBC agreed to present a Compensation and Expense package to individual Center Boards who could introduce the new standards at their convenience.

The Compensation and Expense Package is attached as Annex 6.

Action:

- CBC members to present remuneration package to individual Center Boards.
- CBC members to report outcome of Board discussions at next CBC meeting.

## **Agenda Item 13: Cultural Change in the CG Centers**

John Vercoe tabled a Summary Note to introduce the Agenda Item. After a short discussion, it was decided to discuss this matter virtually prior to the next CBC meeting. This item would be placed on the agenda for a future meeting.

## **Any Other Business:**

### **Draft Agenda for Meeting with Chairman/Director, October 27, 2002**

The CBC discussed items for inclusion on the Agenda with the Chairman/Director of the CGIAR to be held in conjunction with AGM on Sunday, October 27, 2002. A copy of the draft agenda is attached as Annex 7.

### **David McKenzie:**

It was with great sadness the Chair announced the passing of David McKenzie, Chairman of the Board of CIP on October 24, 2002, at his home in Maryland. It was agreed that the

Chair would extend CBC condolences to the David's family. A copy of the Chairman's message is attached as Annex 8.

**Outgoing Chairs:**

The Chairman thanked outgoing Chairs Klaas Jan Beek, Lucy Edwards, Bob Havener, and Martha Stone for their contributions to the CBC and wished them well in their future endeavors.

**Future Meetings:**

It was agreed that the CBC should meet prior to a joint meeting of the CBC/CDC. The next meeting was tentatively set for the week of May 12-16, 2003 in a location yet to be decided. If possible, the timing of this meeting would take place prior to the Spring meeting of ExCo, in order to feed in to the ExCo discussions.

**Action Items:**

As agreed, a list of follow-up Action Items would be prepared and circulated to CBC members. This list is attached as Annex 9.

With a vote of thanks to the Chair, the meeting was adjourned.

## ANNEX 1

### **MEETING OF THE CBC October 24 – 25, 2002 IRRI HEADQUARTERS Los Banos, Philippines**

#### **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

**Chairman:** Dr. John Vercoe, Chair, ILRI

**Vice-Chair:** Mr. Moise Mensah, Chair, ISNAR

Dr. N. Maeno, Board Member, CIAT

Dr. Jag Maini, Chair, CIFOR

Dr. Alex McCalla, Chair, CIMMYT

Mr. Bob Havener, Chair, ICARDA

Dr. Bob Kearney, Chair, ICLARM

Dr. Martha Stone, Chair, ICRISAT

Dr. Mort Neufville, Chair, IITA

Dr. Benchapun Shinawatra Ekasingh, Chair, IPGRI

Mrs. Angeline Kamba, Chair, IRRI

Dr. Klaas Jan Beek, Chair, IWMI

Dr. Remo Gautschi, incoming Chair, IWMI

Dr. Lindsay Innes, Chair, WARDA

Ms. Caryl Jones-Swahn, Executive Secretary, CBC

## ANNEX 2

# CBC Meeting AGENDA

IRRI BOARD ROOM (F.F. HILL ROOM)  
LOS BANOS, PHILIPPINES

OCTOBER 24 - 25, 2002

**Agenda Item 1** Welcome and Introductions

**Agenda Item 2** Review and Approval of Proposed Agenda

**Agenda Item 3**

- Review and Approval of Minutes of October 2001 meeting in Washington, DC
- Review and Approval of Report of September 2002 CBC Retreat

**Agenda Item 4:** Follow-up from September 2002 CBC Retreat:

- ExCo 3 – Update
- Monitoring Center Performance

***CBC/CDC Agenda Items:***

- Grievance Procedures
  - Sr. Staff Appeals
  - Staff Involvement in Governance Issues
- Intellectual Property
- GM Technologies and Codes for Field Release
- Public Awareness/Future Harvest
- Inter-Center Collaboration
  - Challenge Programs
  - African Program Coordination
  - Gender and Diversity

**Agenda Item 5** Implementing EPMP Recommendations

**Agenda Item 6** DG Matters

**Agenda Item 7** CG Nominees on Center Boards

**Agenda Item 8** Board Orientation Programs

- Agenda Item 9**      CBC Communication
- Agenda Item 10**    Leadership and Board Diversity
- Agenda Item 11**    CBC Budget
- Agenda Item 12**    Board Compensation

**Discussion on CDC Meeting**

- Agenda Item 13**    Changing CGIAR Culture
- Agenda Item 14**    Monitoring Center Performance

***Brainstorming Sessions:***

- Agenda Item 15**    Balance between Research, Development and Innovation
- Agenda Item 16**    Science Quality
- Agenda Item 17**    Capacity Building/Training
- Agenda Item 18**    Any Other Business

**ANNEX 3  
MEETING OF THE CBC  
SEPTEMBER 19-21, 2002**

**ACTION ITEMS**

<b>AGENDA ITEM</b>	<b>ACTION ITEM</b>	<b>STATUS</b>
<b>Agenda Item 1</b> Welcome and Introductions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Send note to David MacKinsie and Geoff Miller wishing them speedy recovery (Chairman)</li> </ul>	Complete
<b>Agenda Item 4</b> Public Awareness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ensure that CBC member on PARC, Alex McCalla, receives all necessary documentation for October 23 meeting in Manila (Caryl)</li> <li>• CBC to request CG Secretariat to undertake external review of Future Harvest initiative. TOR for this review should be developed in conjunction with CDC (Chairman)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Complete</li> <li>• CBC/CDC Agenda Item</li> </ul>
Monitoring Center Performance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Create ad hoc committee to consider matter in greater detail and develop criteria/common indicators to monitor the performance of the Centers. Working Group (Chairman)</li> <li>• Report back to full CBC for further discussions (Chairman)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pending</li> </ul>
<u>Agenda Item 6</u> Inter-Center Collaboration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ExCo to be advised of CBC Concern (Moise Mensah at ExCo3)</li> <li>• Monitor pilot Challenge Programs to develop best practices (CBC ongoing)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Complete</li> <li>• Ongoing</li> </ul>
<b>Agenda Item 7</b> Intellectual Property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item
GM Experimentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item

Appeals Process (Sr. Management)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Convey CBC position to CDC and the CG Secretariat (Chairman)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item
Staff T&C Appeals Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Request system-wide HR Advisory Services (HRAS) committee to review HR policies and procedures for each Center (Chairman)</li> <li>• Minutes of HRAS committee held in Colombo, September 7-9, 2002 to be shared with CBC (Caryl)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ongoing</li> <li>• Requested</li> </ul>
Involvement of Staff in Governance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Individual Center policies to be shared with CBC prior to joint CBC/CDC meeting. (Caryl)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Requested</li> <li>• CBC/CDC Agenda Item</li> </ul>
Other Staff Issues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Challenge Programs: Issue of variations in pay grades/scales for staff from different Centers to be discussed with CDC in Manila (Chairman)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
DG Matters	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Board Appointments	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Expand and strengthen existing Board member search and appointment processes;</li> <li>• Formalize sharing processes between Centers.</li> </ul>	

<u>Agenda Item 8</u> Assessing DG Performance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC Agenda, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
<u>Agenda Item 9</u> Update on Science Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CBC to forward names of potential Science Council members, and Science Council chair, to ExCo. (Chairman)</li> </ul>	Complete
<u>Agenda Item 10</u> New Directions in EPMRs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CBC to review iSC document “Guarding and Enhancing the Quality and Relevance of Science” (CBC members)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	Complete CBC Agenda Item
<u>Agenda Item 11</u> Getting more from CCERs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Members to review iSC report (as mentioned above) (CBC members)</li> </ul>	Complete
<u>Agenda Item 14</u> Giving Focus to Africa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discuss during AGM to further the interests and coordination of CG activities in Africa (Chairman to convene meeting?)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC/CDC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item
<u>Agenda Item 15</u> CG Nominees on Center Boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Item for discussion at ExCo3 (Moise)</li> <li>• CBC to formalize procedures for Board member selection (Attachment 1 of CG Secretariat paper). (Chairman to follow up with CG Secretariat)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item
<b><u>Gender and Diversity</u></b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Request briefing at CDC/CBC meeting in Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC/CDC Agenda Item
Board Orientation Programs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Establish CBC standing committee for curricula development for Board Orientation programs (Chairman)</li> <li>• Request Secretariat to provide training materials for in-house Board orientation programs (Chairman)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Enhancing Communication	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare short discussion paper on CBC communications (Chairman/Dr. Maini)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC. Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Strengthening Leadership/Enhancing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare discussion paper on various approaches to developing leadership</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item

Board Diversity	<p>skills (Dr. Maini)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	
Financing CBC	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare discussion paper on CBC program and Budget (Drs. McCalla/Holm-Nielsen)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC. Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Changing CGIAR Culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare short discussion paper incorporating CSIRO data (Chairman)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Board Compensation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare proposal for discussion at CBC. Manila, prior to ratification by individual Center Boards (Drs. McCalla/Havener)</li> <li>• Prepare matrix of Board compensation data (Caryl)</li> <li>• Agenda Item for CBC, Manila (Chairman/Caryl)</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item
Codes of Conduct for Boards of Trustees	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Center Codes of Conduct, Confidentiality Agreements and Corporate Governance Documents to be posted on CBC web (CBC members/Caryl)</li> <li>• Next Steps ??</li> </ul>	CBC Agenda Item CBC/CDC Agenda Item
CBC/CDC Agenda, Manila	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Draft Agenda to be prepared and forwarded to CBC for information and comment (Chairman/Vice-Chairman).</li> <li>• Following items to be included in agenda: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Balance between Research, Development and Innovation</li> <li>○ Science Quality</li> <li>○ Capacity Building/Training</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Complete

**CBC/CDC Joint Meeting  
IRRI  
Los Banos, Philippines**

**October 25, 2002-11-15**

DRAFT AGENDA

- Agenda Item 1:** Opening Remarks by the CDC and CBC Chairs
- Agenda Item 2: Grievance Procedures**
- a: “Codes of Conduct” for:**
    - **Board and Senior Management**
    - **Review Panel Members and Panel Chairs**
  - b: Senior Staff Appeals**
  - c: Staff Involvement in Governance Issues**
  - d: CG Nominees on Center Boards**
- Agenda Item 3: Intellectual Property Management**
- Agenda Item 4: GM technologies and Codes for Field Release:  
current status and need for Harmonization of Codes of  
Practice or Common Policy Principles**
- Agenda Item 5:** Resource Mobilization and Public Awareness in the Centers
- Request for External Review of Future Harvest and TOR
- Agenda Item 6:** Inter-Center collaboration
- a: Challenge Programs
    - Issues e.g. variations in HR Policies (values, rewards, incentives)
    - Cooperation/coordination mechanisms
  - b: African program coordinating mechanisms
  - c: Gender and Diversity Program (request for briefing and discussion to include role and function of G&D program, with review of TOR and future plans)
- Agenda Item 7:** CBC Budget
- Agenda Item 8:** CDC/CBC Meetings (options and annual or bi-annual frequency)
- Agenda Item 9:** Closing Remarks and Task Assignments by the Joint Chairs

## ANNEX 6

### **Compensation and Expense Package for CGAIR Center Board Members**

1. Honorarium: \$350/day, doorstep to doorstep, including travel time most direct routing, reading day and meeting days.
2. In-transit expenses for travel days to cover origination and destination costs, visas, airport taxes, etc.
3. Per Diem at an appropriate level as agreed upon by the circumstances of the Center for off-campus meals, laundry, taxi, and miscellaneous expenses. Center directly pays hotel or reimburses actual hotel cost.
4. No reimbursement for expenses when staying on campus at Center guest house.
5. Travel: Business Class, most direct rout.
6. Spouse travel: permitted to any meeting provided total cost of two economy tickets do not exceed cost of Business Class ticket. If they do, Board member pays the difference.
7. Rules also apply when Board Chair or Board Member is asked to represent the Center at other meetings, field visits, orientation sessions and other official roles as authorized by the Board Chair.
8. Board Chair is entitled to claim up to 10 days honorarium for work conducted for the Center from home as well as an allowance per month for telephone, computer and other local expenses.

**CBC Meeting**  
**Ian Johnson & Francisco Reifschneider**  
**October 27, 2002**

**Makati A Ballroom**

**ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION**

**INTRODUCTION**

**The Rome retreat and the report.**  
Framework of our agenda

**A. THE BIG PICTURE - CHANGES**

1. Are the changes for the better? “Curates egg”
2. Need for closer monitoring and reporting to the System

**B. GOVERNANCE ISSUES**

1. System Governance & b above
2. Board issues

**C. “MANAGEMENT” ISSUES**

1. Senior staff grievances
2. Inter-Centre cooperation
3. Fund raising

**D. ROLE FOR CBC**

1. CGIAR “Senate”
2. Source of Advice to the System
3. How we propose to achieve that role Communication

## ANNEX 8

October 28, 2002

### MESSAGE OF CONDOLENCE

I am writing on behalf of the Committee of Board Chairs of the CGIAR to express our sincere condolences to the MacKenzie family on the loss David.

We were deeply shocked to learn of his death, the news of which came to us on the first day of our meeting here in Manila. Whilst the earlier news we had received was not bright, it was encouraging, and we were hoping and praying that he would make a good recovery.

David was a leading member of our Committee and dedicated to the mission and goals of the CGIAR. He had a vision for our function and role in the CG System which we are now beginning to realise and it is a great disappointment to us that he is no longer here to share in, and work towards, what was essentially his vision. We acknowledge and appreciate his constructive and stimulating contribution to our Committee, to CIP and to the CG System. The impact of his death will be great among us, but we pledge ourselves to continue to work towards the goals and aspirations that he held so dear.

Please convey to the family our most heartfelt condolences. Our thoughts will be with the family as they mourn his death and celebrate his life and his contribution to making a better world.

Yours sincerely

John Vercoe  
Chairman, CBC

**MEETING OF THE CBC  
October 24-25, 2002**

**ACTION ITEMS**

<b>AGENDA ITEM</b>	<b>ACTION ITEM</b>	<b>STATUS</b>
<p><b>Agenda Item 4</b></p> <p>CGIAR Financing</p> <p>Inter-Center Collaboration: Challenge Programs</p> <p>Monitoring Center Performance</p> <p>Grievance Procedures</p> <p>Public Awareness/Future Harvest</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Review of Minutes of ExCo III vs. Summary of Meeting – preparation of background paper for CBC review (Action: Bob Havener)</li> <li>• Joint CBC/CDC Working Group to be established to prepare Code of Conduct for Inter-Center Collaboration. CBC Members: Mort Neufville/Martha Stone</li> <li>• CBC to create Working Group to develop criteria/common indicators to monitor performance of Centers. CBC Members: John Vercoe/Lindsay Ines/Mort Neufville</li> <li>• Chair to determine if CDC should participate in Working Group</li> <li>• Joint CBC/CDC Working Group to be established to produce Code of Personal Conduct for Board Members and Senior Staff. CBC Members: John Vercoe, Martha Stone, Mort Neufville and Bob Kearney.</li> <li>• Board Secretaries to provide individual Center policies (Action: Caryl)</li> <li>• Notes of SAS-HR meeting to be circulated to CBC (Action: Caryl)</li> <li>• CBC to participate on Task Force to Revitalize PARC: CBC Member: Alex McCalla</li> </ul>	
<p><b>Agenda Item 5</b></p> <p>Implementing EPMP Recommendations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CBC to alert Chairman of concerns (Action: Chair)</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Paper to be prepared on Code of Conduct for all reviews (Action: John Vercoe/Benchaphun Shinawatra Ekasingh)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 6</u> DG Matters	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Determine which two Centers did not provide data for AIARC evaluation (Action: Caryl)</li> <li>• Provide CBC list of World Bank comparator organizations (Action: Caryl)</li> <li>• Ensure item is discussed on annual basis (Action: Caryl)</li> </ul>	
<b>Agenda Item 7</b> CG Nominees on Center Boards	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Follow-up with Secretariat (Action: Chair)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 8</u> Board Orientation Programs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Survey Center Boards to determine scope of orientations, curriculum and timing (Action: Angeline Kamba/Martha Stone)</li> <li>• Present results to Secretariat as guide for future requirements (Action: Chair)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 10</u> Gender & Diversity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inform Chairman G&amp;D Board CBC does not endorse second study (Action: Chair)</li> <li>• Review and comment on TORS for G&amp;D Program review (Action: ??)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 11</u> CBC Budget	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Prepare detailed CBC budget (Action: McCalla)</li> <li>• Present budget to individual Center Boards for funding (Action: CBC members)</li> <li>• Determine how/where to open CBC Account (Action: Caryl)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 12</u> Board Compensation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Present Compensation and Expense Package to individual Center Boards for review (Action: CBC members)</li> <li>• Report results at next Board meeting (Action: CBC members)</li> </ul>	
<u>Agenda Item 13</u> Cultural Change in the CG Centers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Agenda Item for next meeting (Action: Caryl)</li> </ul>	